Shakespeare as Cultural Catalyst

iakespeare Survey 64



GLOBAL SHAKESPEARE 2.0 AND THE TASK OF THE PERFORMANCE ARCHIVE

ALEXA ALICE JOUBIN

Crises often usher in great opportunities for innovation. In the face of stiff competition from other forms of entertainment, theatre artists have gone global and digital, taking Shakespeare with them. Hundreds of thousands of Shakespearerelated videos including promotional clips for stage productions - buoyed by a tag cloud - 'live' on the English- and Japanese-language portals of YouTube and other video-sharing and social networking sites around the world.2 Some of these may be transient, but digital video is a large part of Shakespeare's presence in contemporary world cultures, reconceptualizing the idea of liveness and archive. As digital screens become 'the default interfaces for media access' and data mining, the public can express themselves audiovisually on these sites while shaping the resulting archive.3

What are digital video's functions? How can those functions be best facilitated in the field of Shakespeare studies when the disciplinary boundary between text and performance is blurred by virtual performative texts?⁴ This article surveys the state of global Shakespeare and analyses the implications of digital video in current and future scholarly and pedagogic practice. While recent scholarship has begun to address Shakespeare's place in the new media and digital culture, it has not fully engaged digital video archive's impact on the field due in part to a continued interest in new textualities in 'the late age of print'.⁵

VIDEO IN VIRTUAL WORLDS

Online digital video is being tapped as a research and pedagogic resource, marketing tool, and an art form with a symbiotic relationship with the stage. In fact, video is now the core of virtual environments, websites associated with theatre companies, and a small but rich array of scholarly digital archives. Characterized by unique dynamics and challenges, each of these three areas adds a new dimension to global Shakespeare in theory and practice.

These days one can attend a virtual performance of *Hamlet* or a staged reading of *Twelfth*

Portions of this essay have benefited from collaboration with Peter Donaldson whose unfailing helpfulness and generosity as well as his leadership in this field I wish to acknowledge.

² Such as South Korea's Daum tvPot and China's Tudou.com and Youku.com.

³ Pelle Snickars and Patrick Vonderau, 'Introduction', *The YouTube Reader*, ed. Pelle Snickars and Patrick Vonderau (Stockholm, 2009), p. 16; Jens Schröter, 'On the Logic of the Digital Archive', *The YouTube Reader*, p. 341.

⁴ W. B. Worthen, 'Performing Shakespeare in Digital Culture', The Cambridge Companion to Shakespeare and Popular Culture (Cambridge, 2007), pp. 231–2.

⁵ Christy Desmet, 'Paying Attention in Shakespeare Parody: From Tom Stoppard to YouTube', Shakespeare Survey 61 (Cambridge, 2008), pp. 227–8; Richard Burt, 'To E- or Not to E-? Disposing of Schlockspeare in the Age of Digital Media', in Richard Burt, ed., Shakespeare After Mass Media (New York, 2002), pp. 1–32; Espen J. Aarseth, Cybertext: Perspectives on Ergodic Literature (Baltimore, 1997); Katarzyna Kwapisz Williams, Deforming Shakespeare: Investigations in Textuality and Digital Media (Torun, 2009).

Night on Second Life, a three-dimensional virtual world allowing users to interact online with each other through their personalized avatars. Meanwhile, online quest and role-play games such as Arden beckon players to explore first-hand Shakespeare's medieval world or Renaissance Italy.6 In Mabinogi Hamlet, a three-dimensional medievalthemed MMORPG (massive multiplayer online role-play game), one assumes the dual roles of the gamer and the player in the theatrical sense. There is a storyline following the narrative of the Shakespearian tragedy, but the participants are free to reinvent the wheel as they converse with a character named Marlowe who holds the script of Hamlet, watch an animation of the ramparts scene, join Hamlet and Horatio on a stealth mission to follow Claudius, and eventually dress up to become Hamlet - letter in hand and joined by Rosencrantz and Guildenstern on a mysterious ship. It takes an average player approximately four hours to finish the quest. Interestingly, the game ends with a curtain call. All the characters and gamers appear on stage to receive applause.7 Built around sleek visual effects, games such as these are part performance archive and part performance event, combining rehearsed, programmed events and improvisational, contingent actions on and off

As well, many theatre companies have experimented with interactive contents and online videos - live or recorded - to engage existing, future, on-site and off-site audiences before, during and after the productions.8 Some projects bring globally circulating texts closer to a local audience. When Taiwan's Contemporary Legend Theatre was planning their fourth adaptation of Shakespeare, The Tempest, in 2004, the company created a website with rich materials where audiences cast votes for their favourite versions of the adaptation. The company staged the version with the most votes - one that highlighted Taiwan's history as a (post-)colonial island. Other projects focus on bringing local, site-specific performances to a global audience. As the National Theatre Live entered its second season on 14 October 2010, nearly 200,000 people saw London productions

broadcast in high definition to 320 screens in cinemas and theatres in 22 countries. *Hamlet*, directed by Nicholas Hytner with Rory Kinnear in the title role, and *King Lear*, produced by Michael Grandage, are being broadcast in high definition to theatre audiences around the world. Understandably, the service is informed by a sense of national pride. Now in its fifth season, *The Met: Live in HD*, the Metropolitan Opera's Emmy award-winning series of digital performance transmissions have appeared in movie theatres in an even longer list

- ⁶ Arden: The World of William Shakespeare, independent of the renowned Arden Shakespeare editions, is a MMOG (massive multiplayer online game) framed by the narrative of Richard III. It is partially funded by the MacAurthur Foundation and created by Ted Castronova and his team at Indiana University Bloomington. The newly released Assassin's Creed II (Xbox 360 and PlayStation 3), a multimillion-dollar production from Ubisoft makes Renaissance Italy into blockbuster material for a crypto-historical adventure quest game, with Renaissance scholars as consultants. Players can mingle virtually with local residents as they explore highly detailed, 3-D simulations of Florence and Venice in 1477.
- Developed by NEXON in South Korea, Mabinogi has been especially popular in East Asia. It also has a following in North America, Australia and New Zealand. Mabinogi Hamlet was released in August, 2010.
- Peter Holland, 'Passing Through: Shakespeare, Theater Companies, and the Internet', in Shakespeare without Boundaries: Essays in Honor of Dieter Mehl, ed. Christa Jansohn, Lena Cowen Orlin and Stanley Wells (Newark, 2011), pp. 107–19.
- ⁹ Screenings are taking place across the UK, Ireland, the US (including Nassau and Honolulu), Canada, Mexico, South Africa, Australia, New Zealand, Estonia, Finland, Sweden, Poland, Czech, Malta, Germany, Luxembourg, Belgium and the Netherlands. Venues include the Sidney Harman Hall of the Shakespeare Theatre Company in Washington, DC; tickets (\$20) are much more affordable than most live productions of its calibre. Accompanied by majestic music, the promotional video on its website announced that 'for almost fifty years, Britain's National Theatre has been at the heart of theatrical excellence and innovation, then the curtain rose around the world on National Theatre Live - a stunning series of plays captured live in high definition and shown in cinemas worldwide. Now the National Theatre proudly presents a brand new season of the very best of British theatre'. www.nationaltheatre.org.uk/45462/home/ national-theatre-live-homepage.html, accessed 15 November 2010.

of countries around the world. The video broadcast made stage performances more affordable and increased the production value of the plays for both on-site (privileged) and off-site (mass) audiences. The presence of Shakespeare in contemporary culture owes a great deal to these hybrid forms of entertainment.

As the boundary between traditional notions of live and virtual performances becomes ever more permeable, online scholarly archives, publications, and curriculum resources, including such well-established projects as the Internet Shakespeare Editions, also evolve to alter the landscape of Shakespeare and performance studies in significant ways.11 Both online and traditional journals have engaged the Internet in various ways. Borrowers and Lenders: The Journal of Shakespeare and Appropriation, an online journal with a global outlook, advocates a hybrid form of publication. It combines multimedia online contents with a style that seems to be 'nostalgic for print'.12 Readers engage in dialogic reading as they manoeuvre 'between printout and media-rich screen'.13 In preparation of its recent special issue on new media, Shakespeare Quarterly experimented with a hybrid online open-review process and used crowd sourcing to harness the collective wisdom of a self-selected community of scholars. 14 These publications produce permanent documents that cannot be revised. This, of course, contrasts with digital archives, in which revision is always possible and often expected. With institutional backing and public funding, some projects are open access and operate with clearly defined target audiences in mind. Stagework (www.stagework.org.uk/) takes teachers, students, and theatre-goers behind the scene of productions at the National Theatre and regional theatres in England through rehearsal diaries, short videos of interviews and performance footage with commentary.15 Targeting a global audience of scholars, educators and students, the MIT Shakespeare Project has expanded to include several video-centric, collaborative archives, including the Global Shakespeares (http://globalshakespeares. org/) which contains a global array of videos of live performances from the Arab world to Brazil, and Hamlet on the Ramparts, a clearing-house of geographically distant visual and textual resources for a single scene (http://shea.mit.edu/ramparts) which recently appeared on a list of editor's picks in the New York Times. 16 In the works are online editions of the two-volume Cambridge World Shakespeare Encyclopedia, edited by Bruce R. Smith, and the five-volume Shakespeare Encyclopedia: Life, Works, World, and Legacy, edited by Patricia Parker. Both promise innovative uses of worldwide audio-visual contents and an emphasis on global Shakespeare, but have yet to decide on a model of

The Met Live in HD is available in Argentina, Australia, Austria, Belgium, Brazil, Canada, Chile, Costa Rica, Colombia, Croatia, Czech Republic, Denmark, Estonia, Finland, France, Germany, Hong Kong, Hungary, Iceland, Ireland, Italy, Japan, Latvia, Lithuania, Luxembourg, Malta, Mexico, the Netherlands, New Zealand, Norway, Peru, Poland, Portugal, Puerto Rico, Romania, Slovakia, South Africa, South Korea, Spain, Sweden, Switzerland, the UK and Uruguay, and in national movie theatres, independent venues, schools, and museums across the U.S. Prices vary by location. www.metoperafamily.org/metopera/broadcast/hd_events_next.aspx, accessed 15 November 2010.

¹¹ Located at http://internetshakespeare.uvic.ca. Michael Best, 'The *Internet Shakespeare Editions*: Scholarly Shakespeare on the Web', *Shakespeare*, 4 (2010), 221–33.

Essays are available in the PDF format to be printed out, mimicking the style of print journals. However, online versions of many essays 'quote' film stills and video and audio clips in a manner akin to the way in which texts are quoted for analysis. For example, see Alexa Alice Joubin, ed., Asian Shakespeares on Screen: Two Films in Perspective, special issue of Borrowers and Lenders: The Journal of Shakespeare and Appropriation, 4.2 (2009), http://www.borrowers.uga.edu/.

¹³ Christy Desmet, 'Appropriation and the Design of an Online Shakespeare Journal', in *Shakespeare in Hollywood, Asia, and Cyberspace*, ed. Alexa Alice Joubin and Charles S. Ross (West Lafayette, 2009), p. 246.

¹⁴ Katherine Rowe, 'From the Editor: Gentle Numbers', Shakespeare Quarterly, 61 (2010), v-vi.

Stagework is commissioned and funded by the UK Department for Culture, Media and Sport. For studies of Stagework, YouTube Shakespeare, Arden: The World of William Shakespeare, and Second Life, see Peter Holland, 'Performing Shakespeare for the Web Community', in Shakespeare in Hollywood, Asia, and Cyberspace, ed. Alexa Alice Joubin and Charles S. Ross (West Lafayette, 2009), pp. 252–62; and Desmet, 'Appropriation', pp. 227–38.

¹⁶ http://topics.nytimes.com/topics/reference/timestopics/ subjects/h/hamlet/index.html, accessed 2 December 2010.

operation: fully open-access, commercial solutions, or a hybrid form. Not all projects are collaborative in nature or embrace the open-access model. As a commercial enterprise launched in October, 2009, Digital Theatre (http://digitaltheatre.com/) sells downloadable full videos of stage performances and an iPhone app that tracks theatre productions in the UK, with an emphasis on London. BardBox (http://bardbox.wordpress.com/), a syndicated, eclectic collection of videos hosted by commercial services such as YouTube and Vimeo, offers expert commentary on what its sole creator considers 'the best and most interesting of original Shakespeare-related videos', including animations, parodies, recitations, amateur records of stage productions, and student works. 17

THE RISE OF GLOBAL SHAKE SPEARE 2.0

These are signs that the age of Global Shakespeare 2.0 – worldwide performances in digital forms – has arrived. It is an age when archival meanings are co-determined by the locations and digital afterlives of performances. It is an age when Shakespeare has achieved a new level of membership in world literature and on the Internet via diverse channels of exchange, diffusion and dissemination. The term 'global Shakespeare 2.0' is used here to describe a stage in performance theory and practice enabled by digital forms and tools. It is distinct from the hype of what has been called the Web 2.0 in official PR – the brave new, 'democratized' world enabled by the Internet's video and social networking functionalities.

Shakespeare has become a cliché and global Shakespeare a paradox – popularized and commercialized to some yet decided high-brow to others – carrying at once the risk of alienating potential audiences and the promise of rich rewards as a site for artistic innovation. This duality is fuelled by the efficacy of virtual media, video sharing, and social networking sites. Defined by remarkable internal divisions and incongruities, Shakespear-ian performances in our times often embrace self-referentiality and inter-media citational

strategies. Adaptations refer to one another in addition to the Shakespearian pretext. Baz Luhrmann's 1996 film William Shakespeare's Romeo + Juliet, starring Leonardo DiCaprio, is a good example. It brings both the melodramatic and tragic elements of the play into stark relief against modern media fiction and history. Cheah Chee Kong's film Chicken Rice War (Singapore, 2000) parodies Hollywood rhetoric and global teen culture. During the audition for a high school production of Romeo and Juliet in the film, a young lady challenges her classmate, an aspiring actor: 'What makes you think that you can play Romeo? You don't have the looks, and you can't even speak properly...Do you think you look like Leonardo [DiCaprio]?' The two films, along with their undefined Shakespearian sources, engage in the kind of responsive, polyglot, inter-media conversation that makes reading across cultures so compelling today. World literature has come a long way since the time of Johann Wolfgang von Goethe and Christoph Martin Wieland the latter coining the term Weltliteratur. It is now used to refer to the cultural and literary phenomenon driven by globalization rather than a fixed set of texts or canons representing symbolic values of various national cultures. Likewise, global Shakespeare, a phenomenon that began to take shape in the playwright's lifetime, is part of the transnational cultural flow of an ever expanding body of texts that circulate beyond the Elizabethan English culture of origin in various forms of English, in intralingual translation,

¹⁷ The blog is the brainchild of film historian Luke McKernnan who curates the videos and provides basic metadata for each entry.

¹⁸ Cf. Jacques Derrida, Archive Fever: A Freudian Impression, trans. Eric Prenowitz (Chicago, 1998), pp. 16–18.

¹⁹ As an institution and cultural phenomenon, world literature is gaining new momentum, as evidenced by several new initiatives, including the newly founded Institute for World Literature at Harvard University in 2010, directed by David Damrosch, a new anthology of global literary theory in preparation at Routledge, and a rapidly increasing number of undergraduate and graduate courses on global Shakespeare and global literary theory at universities around the world.

and in intersemiotic transformation.²⁰ The last category pertains to a broad range of interpretive possibilities, including political readings, theatrical representations of a play, and digital manipulations and archiving – speech into image, verbal signs to non-verbal signs, and subtitling.

There is another side to the story of global Shakespeare. The new historicist and cultural materialist preoccupation with Shakespeare's representation of cultural others since the 1980s has foregrounded the early modern history of globalization in English literature. In the wake of this line of enquiry, the global history of performance has recently been established as an integral part of Shakespearian scholarship and pedagogy.²¹ The last two decades have marked the first phase of sustained study of Shakespeare performances in a wider world, and a new wave of English-language scholarship since 2000 has further expanded the idea of global Shakespeare.²²

The present time is defined by the rise of global Shakespeare 2.0 as new artistic, digital and intellectual paradigms that are moving beyond the celebratory vision of literary universalism. As performance artists challenge fixed notions of tradition, critics are no longer confined by the question of narrowly defined cultural authenticity. Scholars are now seeking answers to how global Shakespeare formulates first-hand experience rooted in different localities.²³ If the first phase of the study of global Shakespeare was defined by the 'ideological investments in the conventions of authenticity' or resonances of the Globe,24 global Shakespeare 2.0 is shaped by multilocal perspectives enabled by online tools and Shakespeare's 'vernacular applicability' along shifting textual and performative axes.²⁵ More notable interpretations of Shakespeare's plays are emerging across Europe, North America, Africa, Asia, Latin America and the Middle East, and many performances are being archived, read closely and used as case studies in the classroom. Directors such as Ninagawa Yukio, Sulayman Al-Bassam, Ong Keng Sen, and Peter Brook have reached diverse audiences through new strategies to bring together different cultural contexts and genres even as global Shakespeare continues to be defined by its alterity.

However, it is useful to bear in mind that, encompassing not only non-Anglophone interpretations but also the global circulation of performances in any language, global Shakespeare is not always a rosy undertaking. Rendering *Macbeth* in

- ²⁰ Roman Jakobson, 'On Linguistic Aspects of Translation', in The Translation Studies Reader, 2nd edn, ed. Lawrence Venuti (New York, 2004), pp. 138–51.
- Emily Bartels, 'Shakespeare's "Other" Worlds: The Critical Trek', Literature Compass, 5/6 (2008), 1111–38; Carole Levin and John Watkins, Shakespeare's Foreign Worlds: National and Transnational Identities in the Elizabethan Age (Ithaca, 2009); Richard Wilson, Shakespeare in French Theory: King of Shadows (London, 2009); Eric J. Griffin's English Renaissance Drama and the Specter of Spain: Ethnopoetics and Empire (Philadelphia, 2009); Maria Del Sapio Garbero, ed., Identity, Otherness, and Empire in Shakespeare's Rome (Aldershot, 2009).
- ²² Samuel L. Leiter, ed., Shakespeare Around the Globe: A Guide to Notable Postwar Revivals (New York, 1986); Gary Taylor, Reinventing Shakespeare: A Cultural History from the Restoration to the Present (Oxford, 1991); Dennis Kennedy, ed. Foreign Shakespeare: Contemporary Performance (Cambridge, 1993); John Russell Brown, New Sites for Shakespeare: Theatre, the Audience, and Asia (London, 1999); Christy Desmet and Robert Sawyer, eds., Shakespeare and Appropriation (London, 1999); Ryuta Minami, Ian Carruthers and John Gillies, eds., Performing Shakespeare in Japan (Cambridge, 2001); Sonia Massai, ed., World-Wide Shakespeares: Local Appropriations in Film and Performance (New York, 2005); Martin Orkin, Local Shakespeares: Proximations and Power (London, 2005); Margaret Jane Kidnie, Shakespeare and the Problem of Adaptation (London, 2008); Joubin and Ross, eds., Shakespeare in Hollywood, Asia and Cyberspace.
- ²³ Poonam Trivedi, 'Re-Playing Shakespeare in Asia: An Introduction', Re-playing Shakespeare in Asia, ed. Poonam Trivedi and Ryuta Minami (London, 2010), pp. 1–20. Alexa Alice Joubin, Chinese Shakespeares: Two Centuries of Cultural Exchange (New York, 2009), p. 20
- ²⁴ Questions such as 'what is it that endures when [Shake-speare] is deprived of his tongue?' dominated the research in the 1990s (see Kennedy, Foreign Shakespeare, p. 17). Michael Billington, 'Was Shakespeare English?', in Shakespeare: World Views, ed. Heather Kerr, Robin Eaden and Madge Mitton (Newark, 1996), pp. 15–28; Peter Donaldson, "'All Which It Inherit": Shakespeare, Globes and Global Media', Shakespeare Survey 60 (Cambridge, 2007), pp. 183–200.
- ²⁵ Mark Thornton Burnett, 'Writing Shakespeare in the Global Economy', Shakespeare Survey 58 (Cambridge, 2005), p. 185.

Zulu or touring an Arab adaptation of *Richard III* to London would entail a very different level of cultural prestige than translating Korean playwright Yi Kangbaek into English. ²⁶ Wars, censorship and political ideologies can suppress or encourage particular approaches to selected Shakespearian plays or genres, and the digital enterprise is built upon a volatile relationship among content creators (rights holders), platform providers and funding agencies, as evidenced by Viacom's law suits against YouTube and numerous other cases.

DIGITAL VIDEO AND SHAKESPEARE STUDIES

These cases demonstrate that the Internet is never a neutral, universal platform, but a collective of people and 'institutions shaped by local pressures' to create and conserve cultural value.²⁷ The field of literary studies has witnessed the so-called 'linguistic turn', 'cultural turn', and, more recently, 'performative turn', each of which are informed by distinct but inter-connected philosophical principles. The emergence of new media has been crucial to each transitional period in cultural formations.²⁸ Though there have been profound changes in the realm of text through what N. Katherine Hayles calls 'media translation', the digital revolution has had an even more profound effect on how we can use images, text, moving image and sound.²⁹

The field of Shakespeare in performance stands to gain from archival stability and the repertoire of embodied cultural history. A performance video archive with vetted contents and open-access platform can become both the archive and the repertoire. The digital archive and tools are useful not because they are new, but because they are efficient and, in many cases, the only tools to transcend the journalistic mode of research and writing. Just as the arrival of new media technologies – daguerreotype, lithography, typewriter, phonography, cinematography – have reconfigured oral and print cultures, digital video is now transforming the practice and study of the literary and performative arts.

Distinct from analogue media such as photography and film, digital video – as a non-linear, nonsequential medium - can support instant access to any sequence in a performance, as well as the means to re-order and annotate sequences, and to bring them into meaningful conjunction with other videos, texts and image collections. A global archive of Shakespeare as a performed event can play a crucial role in Shakespeare studies by enabling an ever-wider range of interpretive possibilities that activate important aspects of the plays through videos that connect live performances to the concepts of rehearsal and replay. Video recordings have been used in the study of Shakespeare on film and in the theatre for many years, and DVD publication of many commercially released films has made it possible to study the filmtext more closely than in the past, since one can locate and start play of key moments easily, and with some programs one can also bookmark start points for future reference. Reductions in the cost of storage and improvements in video technologies have now made it possible, indeed common, for entire films

As Pascale Casanova observes in *The World Republic of Letters* (Cambridge, MA, 2007), world literature consists of a regime of inequality where dominant languages and literatures subjugate minor ones. See also Richard Nichols, ed., *Modern Korean Drama: An Anthology* (New York, 2009) and Kate McLuskie, '*Macbeth / Umabatha*: Global Shakespeare in a Post-Colonial Market', *Shakespeare Survey 52* (Cambridge, 1999), p. 155.

²⁷ Kate Rumbold, 'From "Access" to "Creativity": Shake-speare Institutions, New Media, and the Language of Cultural Value', Shakespeare Quarterly, 61 (2010), 313–37.

This is a point widely recognized in media studies, but it has not received the attention it deserves in literary studies, except for the theorization of the tension between speech and writing. Jacques Derrida, 'Signature Event Context', in Margins of Philosophy, trans. Alan Bass (Chicago, 1982), pp. 307–30; David Golumbia, The Cultural Logic of Computation (Cambridge, MA, 2009); Jay David Bolter and Richard Grusin, Remediation: Understanding New Media (Cambridge, MA, 1999); Friedrich A. Kittler, Gramophone, Film, Typewriter, trans. Geoffrey Winthrop-Young and Michael Wutz (Stanford, 1999).

²⁹ N. Katherine Hayles, My Mother Was a Computer: Digital Subjects and Literary Texts (Chicago, 2005), p. 89.

and collections of films to be streamed over the Internet.

Though visual and sonic media have become so large a part of emerging Internet culture, the field of digital humanities lags behind these developments in both theory and practice, and 'remains deeply interested [and invested] in text' or the codex book in both academic and commercial initiatives.30 In the many new media studies programmes and departments, where the emphasis is often on social media, fan culture, video and video games and, in contrast to the digital humanities, too little value is often placed on 'legacy media' and the literature and arts of the past.31 There is a gap between these emerging fields that a new approach to the study of Shakespeare in performance through online video collections can help to bridge. Shakespeare spans popular and academic interests and his plays are staged throughout the world. Most of the projects dis-cussed in New Technologies and Renaissance Studies (2008), including Records of Early English Drama, are also oriented towards texts and textual studies. As Michael Greenhalgh and others have written, 'in spite of an increasing number of bright spots, initiatives in the image field have always been more patchy than those involving texts'.32

The contrast is even starker in Shakespeare studies: there are many text-based projects, such as online editions.³³ Shakespeare, a free iPhone application featuring the complete works of Shakespeare (including Edward III and Sir Thomas More), offers a new text based on the Globe Edition, First Folio and early quartos.³⁴ There are electronic versions of other edited texts, digital facsimiles of folios and quartos,35 and some editorial sites offer clips and partial videos of performances, but even sites particularly focused on performance, such as the International Database of Shakespeare on Film, Television and Radio (bufvc.ac.uk.shakespeare), are not illustrated by visual media, while others include still images or brief video clips.36 Open-access full video recordings of theatrical productions are still uncommon. Besides MIT's Global Shakespeares (launched in August 2010), there are two other projects that also feature online, full-length performance video resource with different missions and regional emphases. *Asian Shakespeare Inter-*cultural Archive (A/S/I/A) is an academic project that offers seven full-length streaming videos of recent Chinese, Japanese, Korean and Singaporean productions with English, Chinese and Japanese

- ³⁰ Susan Schreibman, Ray Siemens and John Unsworth, 'The Digital Humanities and Humanities Computing: An Introduction', in A Companion to Digital Humanities, ed. Susan Schreibman, Ray Siemens and John Unsworth (Oxford, 2004), pp. xxiii–xxvii, esp. xxiii. See also Williams, Deforming Shakespeare, George P. Landow, Hypertext 3.0: Critical Theory and New Media in an Era of Globalization (Baltimore, 2006) and Aarseth, Cybertext: Perspectives on Ergodic Literature.
- ³¹ In his theorization of cinema within the histories of media cultures, Les Manovich defines new media forms through five principles (numerical representation, modularity, automation, variability and transcoding). New media forms are defined in contrast to print, television and other electronic media. Manovich, *The Language of New Media* (Cambridge, 2001), pp. 21–50.
- Michael Greenhalgh, 'Digital Still Images and Renaissance Studies (with a Short Section on Digital Video)', New Technologies and Renaissance Studies, ed. William Bowen and Raymond G. Siemens (Tempe, 2008), pp. 27–72, esp. 40.
- 33 Most notably the Internet Shakespeare Editions (internet-shakespeare.uvic.ca).
- 34 Edited by the PlayShakespeare.com team and co-produced with Readdle, Shakespeare is available for free for iPhone users. Shakespeare Pro is available for \$2.99, and it includes a Shakespeare portrait gallery, a searchable glossary based on David and Ben Crystal's Shakespeare's Words, Charles and Mary Lamb's Tales from Shakespeare, and other features. Shakespeare made it to Apple's 'App Store Pick of the Week' in July 2009 selected from among the then 65,000 iPhone applications.
- 35 For instance, the Perseus Collection: Global Shakespeare (http://www.perseus.tufts.edu/hopper/collection? collection=Perseus%3Acollection%3AShakespeare_Globe) and the Shakespeare Quartos Archive (http://www.folger.edu/ pr_preview.cfm?prid=216).
- ³⁶ Examples include the Stanford Shakespeare in Asia site (http://sia.stanford.edu/); Christie Carson, ed., King Lear (Cambridge, 2001). CD-ROM; Global Performing Arts Database (Cornell University; www.glopad.org/); Royal Shakespeare Company's Education website (www.rsc.org. uk/learning/) includes short clips of current and select past productions; the AHDS-funded Designing Shakespeare contains a text and image database and video interviews conducted by Christie Carson, but does not include videos of live performances (http://www.ahds.ac.uk/performingarts/collections/designing-shakespeare.htm).

subtitles. To view the videos, the user has to create an account and log in. Digital Theatre is a commercial enterprise with ten productions and one behind-the-scene documentary at time of writing. In partnership with the Royal Shakespeare Company, the Young Vic, and other British companies, the Digital Theatre's goal is to sell a 'best seat in the house experience'. Launched in October 2009, the company behind the Digital Theatre aims to preserve and monetize archival records of live performances: 'British productions that once would have been lost are now being purchased by global audiences.' There are only two Shakespearian productions available, both from the RSC: Comedy of Errors (dir. Paul Hunter) and As You Like It (dir. Michael Boyd). It could be said that Shakespeare is a paradoxical presence in the age of YouTube: on the one hand there are Shakespeare videos in abundance on the Web - among them many excerpts from Shakespeare films and many remixes which, for example, alternate sequences from two or more versions of Romeo and Juliet, and, on the other hand, there has until now been no substantial collection of videos of Shakespeare theatrical performances designed for scholarly and educational use.

The first decades after the introduction of the Macintosh witnessed the emergence of hypermedia texts, or expanded books, such as the Shakespeare Electronic Archive (SEA). The SEA's Hamlet collection links specific lines of text to page images (all variant pages of the First Folio, all copies of Q1 and Q2, and more than 1200 illustrations) and three complete films.³⁷ These projects share the expanded book model, and a number of them began as stand-alone or modular, plug-in resources, before the advent of the World Wide Web. As newer media gives the 'airy nothing' of Shakespeare in performance a global habitation, an important question to ask is how meanings are formulated, shared and contested, and how we might use the new capacity of the Web to handle large video collections to find a new balance between text and performance. The answers we will get from objects in this multimedia environment that is always in flux depend crucially on the questions

put to them. The encounter between Shakespeare and newer media over the last twenty years has already transformed many of our interpretive and pedagogical practices. Recent advances in network technologies and the growth of social media have brought the field to the cusp of another sea-change.

While one may be limited to digitized texts in a project such as The Dickinson Electronic Archive (www.emilydickinson.org/), Shakespeare offers the richest material for negotiating the transition from textual paradigms or the expanded book model to a truly performance-based mode of understanding cultural production and reception. In part this is because Shakespeare is so widely studied, taught and performed throughout the world, but it is also because it has now become possible to bring together a coherent collection of video recordings of complete productions of sufficient depth to create a densely interconnected video environment in which one can move freely from one performance or sequence to others based on the particulars of the performances themselves rather than solely based on their relation to Shakespeare's text, or to the needs of a text-driven understanding of their significance. A video-centred, rather than a text-centred Shakespeare archive has the potential to transform key scholarly and pedagogical practices in the humanities, and to give performance-based study the precision of reference and the depth of access to the basic documentary materials of the field long taken for granted in the domain of textual studies. Of course digital video can never replace live performance, but it can, especially in a globally interconnected online environment, do many things that the performances it records cannot in themselves do. Digitized performances can form new relationships with the local and global, contemporary and even ancient histories of which they are a part.

As stable, accessible, citable video 'texts' they can become common objects for close study in the classroom and citation in scholarship, and they can become a part of the cultural experience of

³⁷ http://shea.mit.edu/shakespeare/htdocs/main/index.htm, accessed January 2010.

new, globally distributed and potentially unlimited audiences both now and in the future. Further, wider knowledge of contemporary refashionings of Shakespeare in performance are not only valuable in themselves, but can lead us back to Shakespeare's plays with new insight and new paths for interpretation. Works such as Ong Keng Sen's transnational and pan-Asian productions (Search: Hamlet, Lear, Desdemona), Kenneth Branagh's As You Like It with a strong Japanese motif, and Tim Supple's multilingual Midsummer Night's Dream with an Indian and Sri Lankan cast, are generating extraordinary artistic and intellectual energy by recasting gender, racial and social identities. The racial issue disappears by being recast as uneasy familial relations in Japanese interpretations of Othello, and it is made hauntingly present through its absence from radically localized, colour-blind, Korean performances that seek to redress the wound of Japanese colonization. In the Chinese tradition of performing The Merchant of Venice as romantic comedy, the play is often retooled as an adventure of an attractive woman lawyer or an outlandish tale involving a pound of human flesh.³⁸ This framework has activated elements of the play that, over several centuries of Anglo-European readings, have become obscure to communities that gravitate towards the ethics of conversion as a key site of tension in the narrative.39 Other examples of reconfigurations of the centre and the periphery abound. These works have led to the transformation of traditions occurring in both directions at once.

Several factors have limited what we expect to be a major transformation in the ways in which Shakespeare on digital video can be used in scholarship and teaching. First, copyright and other intellectual property restrictions have limited the distribution of digital video on the Web. Second, the tools needed to segment and annotate videos sequences for study and replay have been lacking until now. The programmability of digital video can highlight theatrical contingencies for analysis. Scholarly study requires precision of reference and provision of the means to make evidence available in excerpts; in the case of text footnotes and quotation from sources satisfy this

need. In the domain of video, the equivalent functions include the ability to define a video segment precisely, to insert sequences into one's own interpretive construction, which might be a multimedia essay with playable clips in line or as clickable citations, or a set of annotated clips for presentation. *Global Shakespeares*, a non-profit, open-access project, offers some solutions to these issues.

In the domain of text, what Peter Donaldson calls 'a common object' is taken for granted.41 In text-centric models where other media are present but are adjuncts or expansions of the text, excerpts of texts are cited to draw the attention of a class or readers as evidence to support an argument. The citation can be discussed and referred to as many times as needed in multiple contexts. With well-developed scholarly apparatus and tools such as Google Books one can easily cite digital and codex books as sources. In the domain of performance studies, digital video will be a common object that can be circulated and interpreted by scholars, teachers and students. These replayable clips can become moving image footnotes. Just like texts, a video clip has to be viewed in the context of other films, productions and performance videos of the same play or director, in the context of a worldwide collection of Shakespeare in performance as a whole and in relation to other academic theatrical archives and the expanding user-generated resources available on YouTube and elsewhere.

Currently available digital tools are capable of supporting both the text-centric model and the new model in which image, audio or video collections are the starting place for an

³⁸ Joubin, Chinese Shakespeares, pp. 69-70 and 115-23.

³⁹ Janet Adelman, Blood Relations: Christian and Jew in The Merchant of Venice (Chicago, 2008).

Manovich, The Language of New Media, pp. 47–8; Mark B. N. Hansen, New Philosophy for New Media (Cambridge, 2004), pp. 31–2; Matthew G. Kirschenbaum, Mechanisms: New Media and the Forensic Imagination (Cambridge, 2008), 3; Yvonne Spielmann, Video: The Reflexive Medium, trans. Anja Welle and Stan Jones (Cambridge, 2008), pp. 11 and 112–12.

⁴¹ Peter Donaldson, personal communication, 15 March 2010.

exploration across media.⁴² In addition, the global reach and enhanced possibilities for broad participation of the Web have challenged us to rethink the role of the Shakespeare scholar, the place of English-language/Antipodean Shakespeare in a much wider world, as Shakespearian texts, images and videos are remixed and sampled in the new media, and as more Shakespeare performances that originate in other parts of the world appear on the Web, yet remain as much documents of local, national and regional histories of theatre and performance art as they are of Shakespeare plays.

We have come a long way in the three decades since J. L. Styan's The Shakespeare Revolution, which imagined a 'new role for stage-centred criticism' that uncovers the original 'Shakespeare experience'.43 In 1996, before the advent of the multimedia-enhanced Web environment, James Bulman referred to the ways in which the 'technologies of film and video' can transform readers into viewers by making accessible 'performative elements that would have been denied them' in the study of Shakespeare. The access to performance on multiple levels - rehearsal, production, reception – is the first step to engage with the 'multiple material existences' of a single play.⁴⁴ Recognizing technology's capacity to assimilate performance to literary text, Douglas Lanier identified the challenge for the field during that time as how to avoid reifying the author-function in performance criticism and 'how not to replace the old textuality with a new form of performance textuality which may be "read"".45 In our present moment, scholars are still seeking answers to this question, while streaming video, cloud computing and other technologies are offering even more possibilities to make performed events legible and usable as research and pedagogical materials, going beyond video-cassette and DVD technology.46

Performances are best studied and taught not as isolated instances of artistic expression but as parts of a dynamic network of forms and meanings. Having instant, unpredictable, cross-genre access to videos presages a new relationship between the embodied performance and spectator. Further, the openness and scope of this network of materials,

valuable in itself, are also an essential first step in any attempt at identifying the most artistically innovative and intellectually interesting productions from each region, and formulating interpretive and historical questions on the basis of an adequate survey of the field.

Recent work has shown an acute awareness of the unfinished business of the earlier 'revolution' of Shakespeare and performance studies. For example, *Shakespeare and Modern Theatre*, edited by Michael Bristol and Kate McLuskie, problematizes the relationship between script and theatre, treating the specificities of performance – 'stage behaviours' – not as appendages that give way to the literariness of the Shakespearian script but as agents that participate in defining the play.⁴⁷ Dennis Kennedy goes so far as to propose that 'the medium is not the message'; rather, the message 'is in the spectator's presence'.⁴⁸

Indeed the spectator and performance have recently been recognized as integral components in interpretations of Shakespeare. The second edition of the *Oxford Shakespeare* usefully highlights the performative and collaborative aspects of select texts by rethinking stage directions in the

⁴² Peter Donaldson, 'The Shakespeare Electronic Archive: Tools for On-Line Learning and Scholarship', in *The Internet and the University: Forum 2003*, ed. Maureen E. Devlin, Richard Larson and Joel Myerson (Boulder, 2004), pp. 61–92.

J. L. Styan, The Shakespeare Revolution: Criticism and Performance in the Twentieth Century (Cambridge, 1977), p. 5; James C. Bulman, 'Introduction: Shakespeare and Performance Theory', in Shakespeare, Theory, and Performance, ed. James C. Bulman (London, 1996), p. 1.

⁴⁴ Bulman, 'Introduction: Shakespeare and Performance The-

⁴⁵ Douglas Lanier, "Drowning the Book: Prospero's Books and the Textual Shakespeare', in Shakespeare, Theory, and Performance, ed. Bulman, p. 202.

⁴⁶ The cloud refers to the software that is hosted remotely and that runs once a personal computer connects to the Internet.

W. B. Worthen, Shakespeare and the Force of Modern Performance (Cambridge, 2003); Michael Bristol and Kathleen McLuskie, eds., Shakespeare and Modern Theatre (London, 2001).

⁴⁸ Dennis Kennedy, The Spectator and the Spectacle: Audiences in Modernity and Postmodernity (Cambridge, 2009), p. 4.

context of early theatre practice. In major journals, including Shakespeare Quarterly, Shakespeare Survey, Shakespeare and Shakespeare Bulletin, the appearance of regular or annual performance reviews and, occasionally, essays theorizing the relation between performance and Shakespeare criticism signals that performance approaches to the study of Shakespeare are generally acknowledged. One might even say that performance theory has won its battle, since the term performativity has so thoroughly penetrated literary studies that related concepts are regularly evoked in otherwise text-based studies.

However, there remains a gap between theory and practice, and the contemporary stage performance of Shakespeare has not been adequately mined for its richness. As Barbara Hodgdon surmises, plays are open sites where 'textual obligation' meet 'performative option'. The field of Shakespeare and performance – as demonstrated by practitioners and critics alike - has embraced a new notion of performance embedded within 'cross-disciplinary allegiances' among theatre, television, and digital technologies.⁴⁹ As theatre has formed alliances with other media including video, the study of Shakespeare and performance stands to gain from taking advantage of video's capacity to help decouple text and performance in ideological formations and rejoin them as open sites where negotiations of meanings take place.

VIDEO INTERPOLATION: THE CASE OF HAMLET

A YouTube session offers useful visual and textual cues for exploration. One can follow the trajectory of a single artist through a career or the history of the staging of a particular work, at each point choosing a path through description, title, tags or simply by the visual content of the automatically generated selection of related videos. While such user-generated video sites themselves offer valuable resources for scholarly enquiry – especially in the early stages of a project – they are notoriously under-annotated and do not provide reliable, systematic metadata. *Global Shakespeares* provides both

a video-driven environment and a more familiar catalogue and filtered search method of moving through the col-lection, with the option to switch modes at any time.

A new functionality on the MIT Global Shakespeares site allows users to include numerous video clips selected and arranged to show not only what happens in filmed Shakespeare, but also how it happens - how meaning is created moment to moment in performance, music and shifting cinematic presentation. In research on Shakespeare in performance as well as in education, especially assignments requiring close reading of video in conjunction with text, these tools have proved transforming. The Global Shakespeares archive utilises MediaThread and VITAL (Video Interactions for Teaching and Learning), media analysis communication platforms developed by Columbia University Center for New Media Teaching and Learning with the classroom environment in mind. One can search a video recording of a Shakespeare performance using the text as an index, to define and save replayable user-defined video segments (virtual clips), and to combine one's own text, Shakespeare's text, or secondary literature and video into multimedia essays or presentations. In addition, one can select and 'import' a video or image from the archive or other websites, such as Flickr and YouTube, for in-depth analysis and annotation. Videos can be clipped and embedded, along with still images if one so chooses, into a multimedia essay or in a shared space for discussion. This kind of communication brings the laser pointer to the essay and encourages deep analysis. Instead of just referencing a video and describing the scene, the writer can embed the exact moment and let the reader view the evidence directly and immediately. Students and professors in co-taught classes that are geographically distant can discuss the particulars of performances remotely using clips made and shared in real time.

⁴⁹ Barbara Hodgdon, 'Introduction: A Kind of History', in A Companion to Shakespeare and Performance, ed. Barbara Hodgdon and W. B. Worthen (Oxford, 2005), pp. 4–5.

Such tools make possible precise and copious video illustration, so that an argument or analysis of performed meanings can be shared, extended and critiqued. Even more importantly, having the ability to quickly capture and briefly annotate video sequences can suggest and enable new kinds of discoveries that might not even have been thought of without the tools. Sometimes student work, even in undergraduate subjects, becomes a kind of collaboration with faculty research. A gifted undergraduate at MIT, Mark Seifter, made significant discoveries by very close reading of Micheal Almerevda's Hamlet that complemented ongoing work by Peter Donaldson on the film's counterpointing of Shakespeare's words with Buddhist and other intertexts from Asian religious traditions. The most notable of these is the contrast between Hamlet's despairing 'to be or not to be' in this film and Vietnamese Buddhist monk Thich Nhat Hanh's discourse on 'interbeing'. Another scene of interest is Claudius's prayer in his limousine. As Claudius is jolted by a nasty and dangerous swerve and laments the failure of his words to reach Heaven, his hand covers the video image of the pilgrimage. These visual citations of Asian religious culture turned out to be significant elements of Almereyda's film. Seifter made several significant finds through minute examination of the film, clip definition and replay in conjunction with Web searches. From the tiny fragment of subtitle visible on the monitor in the backseat of Claudius's limo in Almereyda's Hamlet, Seifter was able to identify the film as the German documentary The Saltmen of Tibet. Viewing the clip in context, it became clear that the moment was a turning point in the documentary as well as in Almereyda's film – it marked the passage of the salt gatherers into the sacred territory of the salt goddess, just at the moment at which Claudius's attempt at prayer fails. He recognizes his own exclusion from grace. As for the words Living and Dying on the book Ophelia reads in Hamlet's footage of her, it first appears to be an alternate title for the renowned Tibetan Book of the Dead. However, search among book cover images on the Web revealed that the

face on the cover was that of Krishnamurti and the book a posthumous collection of his thoughts on the same subject – not Tibetan, but still within the orbit of visual allusions to contemporary Asian religious discourses the class was exploring. ⁵⁰

The most sustained infusion of Buddhism in the film as released is use of clips from *Peace is Every Step*, a documentary about Thich Nhat Hanh, leader of the Engaged Buddhism movement. In the context of *Hamlet*, Thich Nhat Hanh's teachings on 'interbeing' answer the brief, repeated video loops of Hamlet reciting the half-line 'to be or not to be' while actively making suicidal gestures – pointing a gun at his head, sticking the barrel in his mouth earlier in the film. As Thich Nhat Hanh continues he is not heard, or not fully heard by Hamlet who is not looking at the screen, but focusing on a hand-held monitor showing his own footage of an erotic encounter with Ophelia.

These key details were elements of design that were not indicated in the published screenplay, and required iterated examination of specific video sequences and the annotations we had made for them in the context of visual evidence from elsewhere in both films and related image materials on the Web. For these works, close reading, the ability to save and revisit clips and annotations, and to weave images and texts into a video-rich analytic framework can alter our understanding.

Other tools offered by the archive frame the object of enquiry to invite particular kinds of intellectual labour. As an archive of Shakespeare as a global, performed event, *Global Shakespeares* connects live performances to the concepts of rehearsal and replay through a federated global

⁵⁰ Peter Donaldson, 'Hamlet among the Pixelvisionaries: Video Art, Authenticity and Wisdom in Michael Almeryeda's Hamlet', in Diana Henderson, ed. *The Black-well Concise Companion to Shakespeare on Film* (Oxford, 2006), pp. 216–37.

search experience. Titles can be located through free search or by using faceted browsing, which allows users to narrow results by selecting one or more choices from lists of Shakespeare play titles, directors, genres, cities and countries. Tags created by researchers, which may or may not be added to what is publicly available for searching, depending on whether their creator wishes to publish them, help generate search results. The data can be viewed as a table, plotted on a world map with satellite and hybrid map-satellite options, or timeline. Dynamic timelines and maps, used in conjunction with faceted browsing and tagged video, allow users to trace the paths of production and dif-fusion of touring productions. If 'distant reading' and graphs, as Franco Moretti suggests, can bring about important changes to the study of literature, such tools for visualization are as important for performance studies. For any given period scholars tend to focus on a select group of canonical works and, as a result, they have allowed a narrow slice of history to pass for the total picture.⁵¹ Maps and timelines of the large number of productions can suggest new questions and unexpected relationships, and – especially important for the study of worldwide performance and emerging forms in a global context - counter the biases of metropolitan constructions of the field of study.

CONCLUSION

The archive is hypomnesic. The archive always works, and *a priori*, against itself.

— Jacques Derrida⁵²

Performance cannot be saved, recorded, documented, or otherwise participate in the circulation of representations of representation.

- Peggy Phelan⁵³

One of the most thought-provoking moments in *Hamlet* is the ramparts scene. When prompted by his father's ghost to remember him and his words, Hamlet responds by committing the ghost's words to writing: 'Now to my word: / It is "Adieu, adieu, remember me". / I have sworn't' (1.5.111–13). The performance archive is a valuable mnemonic device to preserve ephemeral experiences, but the archiving process will always introduce frictions between

embodied (live) and disembodied (recorded) performances. In constructing a privileged relation to our past, the archive as a repository of artefacts and meanings has a dialectical relation to historical knowledge. Jennifer Summit posits that the library not only contains 'written knowledge' but 'manifests ways of knowing', which is why the archive is central to who we are and what we see.⁵⁴

Part archival record and part performance, digital video can register the theatrical contingency in a manipulable medium (with a rich network of video cross-references) that creates discursive knowledge about Shakespeare as site-specific performed events. The exponential growth of global visual and audio representations of Shakespeare's plays provides a fertile ground to explore a fuller range of multimedia and methods. Archiving the otherwise ephemeral history of performance is an important goal, but even more important are the new research questions such archives enable. If, as Diana Taylor theorized, embodied performances have always 'played a central role in conserving memory and consolidating identities in literate, semiliterate, and digital societies',55 the digital performance archive complicates how these identities are circulated. Digital video amplifies the kinds of two-way flows and complex repositionings that make Shakespeare so compelling in our time.

In a broader context, these developments might spell the beginning of the end for 'global Shakespeare' as unproductive shorthand. The digital global age and its attendant imagery replay the message of a Eurocentric or North American centred world as a universal on an even grander scale, though often without the heroic narrative

⁵¹ Franco Moretti, Graphs, Maps, Trees: Abstract Models for a Literary History (London: Verso, 2005); John Bender and Michael Marrinan, The Culture of Diagram (Stanford, 2010).

⁵² Derrida, Archive Fever, pp. 11-12.

⁵³ Peggy Phelan, Unmarked: The Politics of Performance (London, 1993), p. 146.

⁵⁴ Jennifer Summit, Memory's Library: Medieval Books in Early Modern England (Chicago, 2008), pp. 1 and 234.

⁵⁵ Diana Taylor, The Archive and the Repertoire: Performing Cultural Memory in the Americas (Durham, 2003), p. xviii.

of conquest. In an age in which communication is worldwide, instantaneous and image-rich, global Shakespeare can be a site of conflict as well as new artistic and research opportunities. Recognized for its artistic creativity and now established as a field of scholarly enquiry, global Shakespeare remains an ostracizing label, categorizing a group of cultural products that can conveniently be cordoned off. Even though Shakespeare's tragedies, comedies and history plays are undeniably intertwined with the history of many theatrical traditions, global Shakespeare does not quite fit comfortably within any discipline. While post-colonial critics commonly privilege works that critique the role of Western hegemony in the historical record of globalization, the meanings of Shakespeare today are not always determined by post-colonial vocabulary or the discourses of globalization. With the dramatically increased availability of primary research material through digital video archives,

the field may eventually move toward a mode of inquiry that inherently considers performances in comparative contexts. As the field matures, Shakespeare in performance may no longer require such qualifying adjectives as *Asian*, *European*, *African*, or even *global*. Digital video archive can make Shakespeare studies an integral part of public scholarship and the future of humanities as envisioned by Julie Ellison, Kathleen Woodward, and others – a new form of 'making knowledge about, for, and with diverse communities', yielding artefacts of public and intellectual value which include low-cost and high-impact digital videos. ⁵⁶ That is the task of the performance archive.

⁵⁶ Kathleen Woodward, 'The Future of Humanities – in the Present and in Public', Daedalus, Winter 2009, 110– 23; Imagining America: Artists and Scholars in Public Life, www.imagingamerica.org (accessed 5 April 2011).